

SCP/31/5 SUMMARY ORIGINAL: ENGLISH DATE: NOVEMBER 6, 2019

Standing Committee on the Law of Patents

Thirty-First Session Geneva, December 2 to 5, 2019

SUMMARY OF DOCUMENT SCP/31/5: REVIEW OF EXISTING RESEARCH ON PATENTS AND ACCESS TO MEDICAL PRODUCTS AND HEALTH TECHNOLOGIES

Document prepared by the Secretariat

1. The Standing Committee on the Law of Patents (SCP), at its twenty-ninth and thirtieth sessions, held in Geneva from December 3 to 6, 2018, and June 24 to 27, 2019, respectively, agreed that the Secretariat would submit, at the thirty-first session of the SCP, a review of existing research on patents and access to medical products and health technologies, as contained in document SCP/28/9 Rev. (see paragraph 22 of document SCP/29/7 and paragraph 23 of document SCP/30/10). Document SCP/28/9 Rev. is a proposal by the Delegations of Argentina, Brazil, Canada and Switzerland to conduct such a review for Committee's consideration under the agenda item "Patents and health".

2. Pursuant to the above SCP decisions, the Secretariat prepared the said review, which is contained in document SCP/31/5 "Review of Existing Research on Patents and Access to Medical Products and Health Technologies", and submitted it to the Committee's discussions at its thirty-first session to be held in Geneva from December 2 to 5, 2019.

3. In view of the volume of document SCP/31/5, the present document is prepared as a summary of that document.

4. In line with the above SCP decisions, the review was conducted in accordance with the proposal contained in document SCP/28/9 Rev. Specifically, it was undertaken by the Secretariat in consultation with the WHO and WTO Secretariats and included studies prepared by these organizations as well as other relevant intergovernmental organizations (IGOs). The review also includes studies prepared by external researchers commissioned by these organizations, as well as peer-reviewed academic research.

5. As mandated by the Committee, in conducting the said review, the Secretariat primarily searched studies on the following topics:

 The relationship between patents and other related issues and the affordability and availability of medical products and health technologies;¹

 The role of the patent system, including patent quality mechanisms, in incentivizing and promoting the development of new medicines and health technologies to address the global disease burden, facilitating access to medical products and health technologies, and ensuring the supply of quality products;

- The role of the intellectual property system in fostering knowledge spillovers and technology transfer in the medical products and health technologies sector;

 The role of compulsory and voluntary licensing mechanisms and patent pools in facilitating the affordability and availability of medical products and health technologies; and

 The availability of essential medicines in countries where those medicines are not under patent, taking into consideration the variety of other factors both on the supply and demand side that affect availability and affordability.

6. The review covered work produced over the time period of 2005 to 2018. Each study was summarized to provide, in about half a page, factual synopsis of the analysis, key conclusions and recommendations of the author(s) of the study. The list of studies included in the review is presented in the Annex to this document.

7. With regard to the works produced by the IGOs, in addition to the works of WIPO, WHO, WTO, and the works of external researchers commissioned by these organizations, the search was conducted on publications made by, *inter alia*, European Union, UNCTAD, UNAIDS, OECD, UNDP, ICTSD and South Centre.

8. The search of academic literature was conducted on more than 80 peer-reviewed journals, taking into account the relevance of their fields to the mandated topics. The readers should be mindful of the fact that while all identified peer-reviewed academic studies on the above topics have been included in this review, no quality assessment of their contents has been made by the Secretariat. Additionally, as mandated by the SCP, the review does not include working documents, drafts, blogs, commentaries and opinion pieces, etc. which are not considered to be peer-reviewed academic research.

9. Different number of studies have been identified in relation to each of the mandated topics above. Most of the economic and legal literature identified was relevant to the following topics: (i) the role of the patent system in incentivizing and promoting the development of new medicines and health technologies to address the global disease burden; (ii) the role of the patent system in fostering knowledge spillovers and technology transfer in the medical products and health technologies sector; (iii) the relationship between patents and the affordability and

For the purposes of this review, "medical products and health technologies" refers to medicines, vaccines, diagnostics and medical devices.

availability of medical products and health technologies; and (iv) the role of compulsory licensing mechanisms in facilitating the affordability and availability of medical products and health technologies. Less amount of literature has been found in relation to the topic of the availability of essential medicines in countries where those medicines are not under patent, taking into consideration the variety of other factors both on the supply and demand sides that affect availability and affordability. This reflects a lack of published research on that topic in economics, legal or other fields alike.

[Annex follows]

List of studies included in the review of existing research on patents and access to medical products and health technologies:

1. Word Intellectual Property Organization (2015), Chapter 2: Historical Breakthrough Innovations - Antibiotics, World Intellectual Property Report, WIPO, Chapter 2.

2. Life Sciences Program, WIPO (2007), Patent Issues Related to Influenza Viruses and Their Genes: An overview. Working Paper Commissioned by World Health Organization. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/export/sites/www/policy/en/global_health/pdf/influenza.pdf.

3. World Health Organization (2011), Increasing Access to Diagnostics Through Technology Transfer and Local Production. Available at:

https://www.who.int/phi/publications/Increasing_Access_to_Diagnostics_Through_Technology_ Transfer.pdf.

4. World Health Organization (2014), Access to Affordable Medicines for HIV/AIDS and Hepatitis: The Intellectual Property Rights Context. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (SEA-TRH-16). Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/204741/B5144.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

5. World Health Organization (2005), Access to Medicines and Vaccines: Implication of Intellectual Property Protection and Trade Agreements. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (SEA/HMM/Meet.23/5). Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/127615/WP%205%20-%20Access%20to%20M edicines%20and%20Vaccines.pdf?sequence=1.

6. World Health Organization (2017), Country Experiences in Using TRIPS Safeguards: Part I. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (UHC Technical Brief). Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/272977/Country-experiences-TRIPS-Part1.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

7. World Health Organization (2017), Country Experiences in Using TRIPS Safeguards: Part II. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (UHC Technical Brief). Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/272978/Country-experiences-TRIPS-Part2.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

8. World Health Organization (2005), WHO Drug Information, Vol. 19, No. 3. World Health Organization. Available at: https://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/pdf/s7918e/s7918e.pdf.

9. World Health Organization (2010), Intellectual Property and Access to Medicines: Papers and Perspectives. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (SEA-TRH-010). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s17521en/s17521en.pdf.

10. World Health Organization (2009), International Trade and Health: A Reference Guide. World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (ISBN 978-92-9022-336-8). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s19126en/s19126en.pdf.

11. World Health Organization (2018), Progress Report on Access to Hepatitis C Treatment Focus on Overcoming Barriers in Low- and Middle-Income Countries. World Health Organization, Geneva (WHO/CDS/HIV/18.4). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s23381en/s23381en.pdf.

12. World Health Organization (2017), Public Health Protection in Patent Laws: Selected Provisions, World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (UHC Technical Brief). Available at: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/272976/Public-health-protection.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

13. World Health Organization (2006), TRIPS, Intellectual Property Rights and Access to Medicines, World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia (Briefing Note). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s21415en/s21415en.pdf.

14. World Health Organization and Health Action International (2008), Measuring Medicine Prices, Availability, Affordability and Price Components (2nd edition), World Health Organization (WHO/PSM/PAR/2008.3). Available at:

https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/70013/WHO_PSM_PAR_2008.3_eng.pdf?sequ ence=1.

15. World Health Organization, World Intellectual Property Organization and World Trade Organization (2012), Promoting Access to Medical Technologies and Innovation: Intersections between Public Health, Intellectual Property and Trade. World Health Organization, Geneva (WHO ISBN 978-92-415-0487-4). Available at:

http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/78069/9789241504874_eng;jsessionid=6AE6CC CD0F34B919C2AFD9DEA4990185?sequence=1.

16. International Center for Trade and Sustainable Development and World Health Organization (2011), Pharmaceutical Production and Related Technology Transfer. World Health Organization, Geneva (ISBN 978 92 4 150235 1).

17. Commission on Intellectual Property Rights, Innovation and Public Health (2006), Public Health, Innovation and Intellectual Property Rights. World Health Organization, Geneva (ISBN 92 4 156323 0). Available at:

http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s14146e/s14146e.pdf.

18. United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS, World Health Organization and United Nations Development Programme (2011), Using TRIPS flexibilities to Improve Access to HIV Treatment. UNAIDS, WHO and UNDP (Policy Brief). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s18392en/s18392en.pdf.

19. Abbas M. Z. and Riaz S. (2013), Flexibilities under TRIPS: Implementation Gaps between Theory and Practice, *Nordic Journal of Commercial Law*, No. 1, pp. 1-25.

20. Abbott F. M. (2011), Comparative Study of Selected Government Policies for Promoting Transfer of Technology and Competitiveness in the Colombian Pharmaceutical Sector. United States Agency for International Development – Programa MIDAS, 2007. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228247080_Comparative_Study_of_Selected_Govern ment_Policies_for_Promoting_Transfer_of_Technology_and_Competitiveness_in_the_Colombi an Pharmaceutical_Sector.

21. Adusei P. (2011), Exploiting Patent Regulatory "Flexibilities" to Promote Access to Antiretroviral Medicines in Sub-Saharan Africa, *The Journal of World Intellectual Property*, Vol. 14, No. 1, pp. 1-20.

22. Amin Tahir and Aaron S. Kesselheim (2012), Secondary Patenting of Branded Pharmaceuticals: A Case Study of How Patents on Two HIV Drugs could Be Extended for Decades, *Health Affairs*, Vol. 31, No. 10, pp. 2286-2294.

23. Andrew Jenner, Niresh Bhagwandin, Stanley Kowalski (2017), Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) and Multidrug Resistance (MDR): Overview of Current Approaches, Consortia and Intellectual Property Issues, Global Challenges Report, WIPO. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/edocs/pubdocs/en/wipo_pub_gc_15.pdf.

24. Athreye Suma, Dinar Kale, Shyama V. Ramani (2009), Experimentation with Strategy and the Evolution of Dynamic Capability in the Indian Pharmaceutical Sector, *Industrial and Corporate Change*, Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 729-759.

25. Baker B.K. (2018), A Sliver of Hope: Analyzing Voluntary Licenses to Accelerate Affordable Access to Medicines, *Northeastern University Law Review*. Vol. 10, No. 2, pp. 91-780.

26. Bazargani Y. T., Ewen M., De Boer A., Leufkens H. G. M. and Mantel-Teeuwisse A. K. (2014), Essential Medicines are More Available than Other Medicines Around the Globe, *PLOS One*. Vol. 9, No. 2, e87576, pp. 1-7.

27. Beall R. and Kuhn R. (2012), Trends in Compulsory Licensing of Pharmaceuticals Since the Doha Declaration: A Database Analysis. *PLOS Medicine.* Vol. 9, No. 1, e1001154, pp. 1-9.

28. Beall RF & A Attaran (2016), Patent-based analysis of the World Health Organization's 2013 Model List of Essential Medicines. Global Challenges Report, WIPO. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/edocs/mdocs/mdocs/en/wipo_gc_ip_ge_16/wipo_gc_ip_ge_16_www_3344 37.pdf.

29. Berndt Ernst R. and Iain M. Cockburn (2014), The Hidden Cost Of Low Prices: Limited Access to New Drugs in India, *Health Affairs*, Vol. 33, No. 9, pp. 1567-1575.

30. Berndt Ernst R., Nathan Blalock, and Iain M. Cockburn (2011), Diffusion of New Drugs in the Post-TRIPS Era, *International Journal of the Economics of Business*, Vol. 18, No. 2, pp. 203–224.

31. Bhaduri Saradindu and Thomas Brenner (2013), Examining the Determinants of Drug Launch Delay in pre-TRIPS India, *The European Journal of Health Economics*, Vol. 14, No. 5, pp. 761-773.

32. Branstetter Lee, Chirantan Chatterjee and Matthew J. Higgins (2016), Regulation and Welfare: Evidence from Paragraph IV Generic Entry in the Pharmaceutical Industry, *The RAND Journal of Economics*, Vol. 47, No. 4, pp. 857-890.

33. Cameron A., Ewen M., Ross-Degnan D., Ball D. and Laing R. (2008), Medicine Prices, Availability, and Affordability in 36 Developing and Middle-Income Countries: A Secondary Analysis, *The Lancet*. Vol. 373, No. 9659. DOI:10.1016/S0140-6736(08)61762-6, pp. 240-249.

34. Chadha Alka (2009) Product Cycles, Innovation, and Exports: A Study of Indian Pharmaceuticals, *World Development*, Vol. 37, No. 9, pp. 1478-1483.

35. Chaudhuri Shubham, Pinelopi K. Goldberg and Panle Jia (2006), Estimating the Effects of Global Patent Protection in Pharmaceuticals: A Case Study of Quinolones in India, *The American Economic Review*, Vol. 96, No. 5, pp. 1477-1514.

36. Ching Andrew T. (2010), A dynamic Oligopoly Structural Model for the Prescription Drug Market after Patent Expiration, *International Economic Review*, Vol. 51, No. 4, pp. 1175-1207.

37. Cockburn Iain M., Jean O. Lanjouw and Mark Schankerman (2016), Patents and the Global Diffusion of New Drugs, *The American Economic Review*, Vol. 106, No. 1, pp. 136-164.

38. Cohen-Kohler J. C., Forman L. and Lipkus N. (2008), Addressing Legal and Political Barriers to Global Pharmaceutical Access: Options for Remedying the Impact of the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) and the Imposition of TRIPS-plus Standards, *Health Economics Policy and Law.* Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 229-256.

39. Correa. C. M. (2009), Guide for the Application and Granting of Compulsory Licenses and Authorization of Government Use of Pharmaceutical Patents, World Health Organization, Geneva (WHO/PHI/2009.1). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s19902en/s19902en.pdf.

40. Danzon Patricia, Andrew Mulcahy, and Adrian Towse (2015), Pharmaceutical Pricing in Emerging Markets: Effects of Income, Competition, and Procurement, *Health Economics*, Vol. 24, pp. 238-252.

41. Dhar Biswajit and K.M. Gopakumar (2006), Post-2005 TRIPS Scenario in Patent Protection in the Pharmaceutical Sector: The Case of the Generic Pharmaceutical Industry in India, UNCTAD/ICTSD.

42. Duggan Mark, Craig Garthwaite and Aparajita Goyal (2016), The Market Impacts of Pharmaceutical Product Patents in Developing Countries: Evidence from India, *The American Economic Review*, Vol. 106, No. 1, pp. 99-135.

43. Ellison Glenn and Sara Fisher Ellison (2011), Strategic Entry Deterrence and the Behavior of Pharmaceutical Incumbents Prior to Patent Expiration, *American Economic Journal: Microeconomics*, Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 1-36.

44. Eric Bond and Kamal Saggi (2014), Compulsory Licensing, Price Controls, and Access to Patented Foreign Products, *Journal of Development Economics*, Volume 109, pp. 217-228.

45. European Commission (2009) Pharmaceutical Sector Inquiry – Final Report. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/competition/sectors/pharmaceuticals/inquiry/.

46. Flynn S., Hollis A. and Palmedo M. (2009), An Economic Justification for Open Access to Essential Medicines in Developing Countries, *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics.* Vol. 37, No. 2, pp. 184-208.

47. Galasso Alberto and Mark Schankerman (2015), Patents and Cumulative Innovation: Causal Evidence from the Courts, *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Vol. 130, No. 1, pp. 317-369.

48. Gamba Simona (2017), The Effect of Intellectual Property Rights on Domestic Innovation in the Pharmaceutical Sector, *World Development*, Vol. 99, pp. 15-27.

49. Gilchrist Duncan S. (2016), Patents as a Spur to Subsequent Innovation? Evidence from Pharmaceuticals, *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, Vol. 8, No. 4, pp. 189-221.

50. Goldberg Pinelopi K. (2010), Intellectual Property Rights Protection in Developing Countries: The Case of Pharmaceuticals, *Journal of the European Economic Association*, Vol. 8, No. 2-3, pp. 326-353.

51. Grabowksi Henry, Carlos Brain, Anna Taub, and Rahul Guha (2017), Pharmaceutical Patent Challenges: Company Strategies and Litigation Outcomes, *American Journal of Health*

Economics, Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 33-59.

52. Guennif S. and Chaisse J. (2007), Present Stakes around Patent Political Economy: Legal and Economic Lessons from the Pharmaceutical Patent Rights in India, *Asian Journal of WTO and International Health Law and Policy*. Vol. 2, No. 1 pp. 65-98.

53. Hemphill C. Scott and Bhaven N. Sampat (2011), When Do Generics Challenge Drug Patents?, *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies*, Vol. 8, No. 4, pp. 613-649.

54. Hemphill C. Scott and Bhaven N. Sampat (2012), Evergreening, Patent Challenges, and Effective Market Life in Pharmaceuticals, *Journal of Health Economics*, Vol. 31, No. 2, pp. 327-339.

55. Ho C. W. L. and Leisinger K. M. (2013), Intellectual Property and Access to Essential Medicines: A Tenuous Link?, *Asian Bioethics Review.* Vol. 5, No. 4, pp. 376-382.

56. Horner R. (2014), The Impact of Patents on Innovation, Technology Transfer and Health: A Pre- and Post-TRIPS Analysis of India's Pharmaceutical Industry, *New Political Economy*, Vol, 19, No. 3, pp. 284-406.

57. Jack William and Jean O. Lanjouw (2005), Financing Pharmaceutical Innovation: How Much Should Poor Countries Contribute?, *The World Bank Economic Review*, Vol. 19, No. 1, pp. 45–67.

58. Janodia M. D., Sreedhar D., Ligade V. S. and Udupa N. (2008), Facets of Technology Transfer: A Perspective of Pharmaceutical Industry, *Journal of Intellectual Property Rights*, Vol. 13, pp. 28-34.

59. Kampf R. (2015), Special Compulsory Licenses for Export of Medicines: Key Features of WTO Members' Implementing Legislation. WTO, Geneva (ERSD-2015-07). Available at: https://www.wto.org/english/res_e/reser_e/ersd201507_e.pdf.

60. Katz M. L., Mueller L. V., Polyakov M. and Weinstock S. F. (2006), Where Have All the Antibiotic Patents Gone?, *Nature Biotechnology*, Vol. 24, No. 12, pp. 1529-1531.

61. Krattiger A., Mahoney R.T., Chiluwal A. and Kowalski S.P. (2012), Patent Information, Freedom to Operate and "Global Access": A Case Study of Dengue Vaccines Under Development, Global Challenges Report, WIPO. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/edocs/pubdocs/en/wipo_pub_gc_2.pdf.

62. Kuan E. S. (2009), Balancing Patents and Access to Medicines, *Singapore Academy of Law Journal*, Vol. 21, pp. 457-484.

63. Kyle Margaret K. and Anita M. McGahan (2012), Investments in Pharmaceuticals Before and After TRIPS, *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, Vol. 94, No. 4, pp. 1157-1172.

64. Lakdawalla Darius and Tomas Philipson (2012), Does Intellectual Property Restrict Output? An Analysis of Pharmaceutical Markets, *Journal of Law & Economics*, Vol. 55, No. 1, pp. 151-187.

65. Li Xuan (2008), The Impact of Higher Standards in Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical Industries under the TRIPS Agreement – A Comparative Study of China and India, *World Economy*, Vol. 31, No. 10, pp. 1367-1382.

66. Mackey T. K. and Liang B. A. (2012), Patent and Exclusivity Status of Essential Medicines for Non-Communicable Disease, *PLOS One.* Vol 7. No. 11, e51022, pp. 1-8.

67. Mazzoleni Roberto (2011) Before Bayh–Dole: Public Research Funding, Patents, and Pharmaceutical Innovation (1945–1965), *Industrial and Corporate Change*, Vol. 20, No. 3, pp. 721–749.

68. McKeith S. (2014), Pharmaceutical Patents in Developing Nations: Parallel Importation and the Doctrine of Exhaustion, *African Journal of Legal Studies*. Vol. 6, No. 2-3, pp. 287-314.

69. Mecurio B. (2007), Resolving the Public Health Crisis in the Developing World: Problems and Barriers of Access to Essential Medicines, *Northwestern Journal of International Human Rights*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp. 1-40.

70. Moon S. (2008), Does TRIPS Art. 66.2 Encourage Technology Transfer to LDCs? An Analysis of the Country Submissions to TRIPS Council (1999-2007). UNCTAD – ICTSD Project on IPRs and Sustainable Development, Geneva. Available at: https://unctad.org/en/Docs/iprs_pb20092_en.pdf.

71. Nguyen A. T., Knight R., Mant A., Cao Q. M. and Auton M. (2009), Medicine Prices, Availability and Affordability in Vietnam, *Southern Med Review*, Vol. 2, No. 2, pp. 2-9.

72. Padmanabhan S., Amin T., Sampat B., Cook-Deegan R. and Chandrasekharan S. (2010), Intellectual Property, Technology Transfer and Manufacture of Low-Cost HPV Vaccines in India, *Nature Biotechnology.* Vol. 28, No. 7, pp. 671-678.

73. Panattoni Laura E. (2011), The effect of Paragraph IV Decisions and Generic Entry Before Patent Expiration on Brand Pharmaceutical Firms, *Journal of Health Economics*, Vol. 30, No. 1, pp. 126-145.

74. Perriëns J. and Habiyambere V. (2014), Access to Antiretroviral Drugs in Low- and Middle-Income Countries. World Health Organization, Geneva (ISBN 978 92 4 150754 7). Available at: http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/documents/s21630en/s21630en.pdf.

75. Puasiri W. (2013), Improving Patent Quality through Pre-grant Opposition in Thailand. *Journal of International Commercial Law and Technology*, Vol. 8, No. 4, pp. 219-253.

76. Qian Yi (2007), Do National Patent Laws Stimulate Domestic Innovation in a Global Patenting Environment? A Cross-Country Analysis of Pharmaceutical Patent Protection, 1978-2002, *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, Vol. 89, No.3, pp.436-453.

77. Quinn R. (2013), Rethinking Antibiotic Research and Development: World War II and the Penicillin Collaborative, *American Journal of Public Health*, Vol. 103, No. 3, pp. 426-343.

78. Reed F Beall, Patents and the WHO Model List of Essential Medicines (18th Edition): Clarifying the Debate on IP and Access, Global Challenges Brief, WIPO. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/edocs/mdocs/mdocs/en/wipo_gc_ip_ge_16/wipo_gc_ip_ge_16_brief.pdf.

79. Regan Tracy L. (2008), Generic Entry, Price Competition, and Market Segmentation in the Prescription Drug Market, *International Journal of Industrial Organization*, Vol. 26, No. 4, pp. 930-948.

80. Reiffen David and Michael R. Ward (2006), Generic Drug Industry Dynamics, *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, Vol. 87, No. 1, pp. 37-49.

81. Ryan Michael P. (2010) Patent Incentives, Technology Markets, and Public-Private Bio-Medical Innovation Networks in Brazil, *World Development*, Vol. 38, No. 8, pp. 1082-1093.

82. Sampath Padmashree Gehl (2005), Economic Aspects of Access to Medicines after 2005: Product Patent Protection and Emerging Firm Strategies in the Indian Pharmaceutical Industry, United Nations University-Institute for New Technologies (UNU-INTECH): Commissioned by WHO and CIPIH.

83. Schweitzer Stuart O. and William S. Comanor (2011), Prices Of Pharmaceuticals In Poor Countries Are Much Lower Than In Wealthy Countries, *Health Affairs*, Vol. 30, No. 8, pp. 1553-1561.

84. Stavropoulou, C. and Valletti, T. (2015), Compulsory Licensing and Access to Drugs, *The European Journal of Health Economics*, Vol. 16, No. 1, pp. 83-94.

85. Stevens H., Huys I., Debackere K., Goldman M., Stevens P. and Mahoney R. T. (2017), Vaccines: Accelerating Innovation and Access. Global Challenges Report, WIPO. Available at: https://www.wipo.int/publications/en/details.jsp?id=4224&plang=EN.

86. T'Hoen E., Berger J., Calmy A. and Moon S. (2011), Driving a Decade of Change: HIV/AIDS, Patents and Access to Medicines for All, *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, Vol. 14, No. 15, pp. 1-12.

87. Vandoros Sotiris (2014), Therapeutic Substitution Post-Patent Expiry: The Cases of ACE Inhibitors and Proton Pump Inhibitors, *Health Economics*, Vol. 23, pp. 621-630.

88. Watal Jayashree and Rong Dai (2019), Product Patents and Access to Innovative Medicines in a Post-TRIPS-Era, WTO, Staff Working Paper ERSD-2019-05.

89. Williams Heidi (2013), Intellectual Property Rights and Innovation: Evidence from the Human Genome, *Journal of Political Economy*, Vol. 121, No. 1, pp. 1-27.

90. Zainol Z. A., Amin L., Jusoff K., Zahid A. and Akpoviri F. (2011), Pharmaceutical Patents and Access to Essential Medicines in Sub-Saharan Africa, *African Journal of Biotechnology*, Vol. 10. No. 58 pp.12376-12388.

91. Zhang M., Zheng J., Kong X. and Wan J.(2016), Research and Development of Antibiotics: Insights From Patents and Citation Network, *Expert Opinion on Therapeutic Patents*, Vol. 26, No. 5, pp.617-627.

[End of Annex and of document]